

Knowledge Mapping Analysis of Intangible Cultural Heritage Based on CSSCI Journal Articles

Xiaolei Guo¹, and Can Mo^{2*}

¹*Guangdong Literary & Art Vocational College, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China*

²*Guangzhou Maritime University, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China*

**Corresponding author: Can Mo.*

Abstract

In this study, CiteSpace knowledge mapping software was used to draw a knowledge map of domestic research on China's intangible cultural heritage (ICH) from 2011 to 2024 and extract the hotspots of research on the overall situation of research on intangible heritage in the academic community since 2013. We find that research on ICH has entered a rapid development stage in recent years, and a series of high-level research results have been achieved. The “core group of authors” is gradually being established, and the research results are gradually enriched. With the development of science and technology, the related research field is gradually forming into a new field of multidisciplinary and inter-specialized research, and the national level is also paying more attention to the research of ICH. At the same time, however, there are some problems, such as the lack of collaboration between research organizations and researchers, and the fragmentation of research, which is not conducive to broader research. Although the field of ICH has been developed for more than 20 years, how to position the field scientifically is still worthy of in-depth consideration. How to effectively serve China's ICH and its past research results for its creative transformation and innovative development is also a major issue that researchers in the field need to pay attention to and solve today.

Keywords

intangible cultural heritage (ICH), knowledge map, safeguarding and transmission, visualization

1. Introduction

China's intangible cultural heritage (ICH) is rich in number and diverse in type, which is the living product of the excellent traditional culture of the Chinese nation that has continued to this day, and is also the main expression of the cultural self-confidence of the Chinese nation. Since the reform and opening up, the status quo and problems of ICH have been studied by academics in theory and practice in an all-round and multi-level research. It is necessary to protect, pass on and promote the cause of China's ICH, and to prompt people from all walks of life and even foreign enthusiasts to begin to understand and explore the excellent traditional culture of the Chinese nation.

Therefore, this study uses CiteSpace knowledge mapping software to systematically organize and analyze 1,000 core journal papers on ICH research in China, with CSSCI Chinese Social Sciences Citation Index as the main data source. Through the mapping, the overall overview of current researchers' research on ICH is

visualized, the key research topics in each period are clarified, and the future development trend of scientific research is envisioned, in order to provide a basis for further scientific research development.

2. Data Sources and Research Methodology

2.1 Research Data

A total of 1,054 search results were obtained by searching the CSSCI Chinese Social Sciences Citation Index with “ICH Research” as the title. After checking the 1054 search results one by one and eliminating the data of laws and regulations, result reports, tool books and government documents, we obtained 1000 valid data. The 1000 valid papers were saved and exported in the form of “Refworks”, which was converted into its own format by CiteSpace 5.1 program to realize visual analysis, and the time node was set as 2011.01-2021.12, and the time slice was 1. The collected data were analyzed in terms of the time of issuance, the total number of articles, and the organization of issuance, The data collected from the time of publication, total number of publications, organization of publications, core authors and keywords co-occurrence, etc. were visualized to show the current hotspots of scientific research on ICH and its development trend in China.

2.2 Research Methodology

The scientific and technological mapping method integrates the theories and models of multiple disciplines, and demonstrates the evolutionary process law of the origin and development of a certain field of research in the form of more intuitive and vivid pictures. With the help of CiteSpace image visualization software, this research result analyzes the number of published research related to China's ICH, the time and spatial distribution of research, the research organization, core authors, the total citations of the articles, and the keywords in a more intuitive way by drawing knowledge images. The overall status of research on ICH is presented in the form of data and images, and the network of structural relationships and the development of major topics of current research on ICH in China are depicted in conjunction with the research on important CSSCI papers. In order to ensure that the search results can cover all the representative results of the research, and at the same time take into account the completeness of the search and the precision of the detection, the full text is determined to use “ICH” as the search term, and search the results of the research papers containing “ICH” in the title of the CSSCI articles. The article category is academic journals, and the search date is January 15, 2024.

3. Data analysis and Research Review

Here the 1000 search results are analyzed in terms of time and interval distribution, core author distribution, research institution distribution, major publication areas and journal distribution.

3.1 Time Interval Distribution

Temporal and regional distribution of ICH research can reflect the extent to which the relevant research areas have received attention in the academic community.

According to the display of journal papers included in CSSCI, the research of ICH in China can be traced back to the 1990s of the last century at the earliest. After entering the twenty-first century, the discussion around a series of issues such as the value and protection of ICH, as represented by *How Libraries Actively Participate in the Protection and Development of ICH* (Jin et al., 2003) and *On the Preservation of Agrarian Cultural Resources and ICH* (Qiao, 2003), has become one of the early masterpieces in this field. ICH research has significant stage characteristics in terms of the annual frequency of articles, experiencing an obvious outbreak phase (2003-2009), a stable high growth phase (2010-2013), and entering a relatively gentle fluctuation period starting from 2014 (2014-2021).

The temporal trend of ICH research can be largely attributed to the Convention for the *Safeguarding of the ICH* (hereinafter referred to as “the Convention”) promulgated by the United Nations Educational,

Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) in 2003, to which China formally acceded in August 2004, and which will “bring a new framework, ethics, thinking, and initiatives to China and the world” with its new ideas and definitions of ICH. and the world at large” (Hu, 2014). In addition, the successive establishment of safeguarding centers for ICH at all levels, the 2011 *Law of the People's Republic of China on ICH*, and the 2016 *Report on the Safeguarding and Development of China's ICH* have made clearer plans and boundaries for the inheritance and development of China's ICH, marking the national cultural traits and manifesting the national characteristics. The inheritance and development of ICH should be combined with modern science and technology and people's daily life, which promotes the academic community's deep concern for its research and protection. In addition to relevant policies and initiatives to support the sustainable development of ICH in China, the enthusiasm and motivation of research on ICH in all academic circles have also rapidly led to its betterment and popularization. Therefore, this paper will focus on the research status of ICH in Chinese academia in the past ten years since the promulgation of the *Law of the People's Republic of China on ICH*, with the hope of proposing basic ideas for further in-depth research.

3.2 Distribution of Core Authors

With the help of the visualization image formed by CiteSpace software, the authorship of the academic community about the research field of ICH as well as the communication and cooperation between the authors of the relevant research can be reflected more intuitively and clearly. The core author group of ICH research is drawn with frequency 2. There are 56 author nodes (N), which indicates that scholars researching ICH have already formed a certain scale; the number of connecting lines (E) is less and finer, with only 16, which indicates that research authors of the related fields are largely lacking in exchanges and cooperation at present; and the density of cooperation network (Density) is 0.0104, which is lower. 0.0104, the low density also presents the research situation that scholars are independent and lack of communication and cooperation.

By statistically analyzing the number of articles issued by the core authors, it can be found that the largest number of articles issued in the field of ICH research in the current academic world is Huang Yonglin, a professor at Central China Normal University, with a total of nine articles. According to the bibliometrics Price's law can further determine the core authors in this field. It is calculated that authors with 2 or more publications can be considered as core authors. The information obtained from the CiteSpace software was summarized and analyzed yielding a total of 295 researchers in the field, with 81 core authors, accounting for 27.4% of the total (> 10%). Among them, the 81 core authors published a total of 199 articles, accounting for 48.1% (< 50%) of the overall results. This indicates that a “core group of authors” for ICH research is gradually being established, and more and more scholars are consistently producing research results in this field, and the research results are gradually enriched. However, on the whole, the number of articles published is far from enough, and the depth and breadth of the research covered also need to be improved. From the perspective of research fields, the relevant research is stuck in humanities and social sciences (literature, law, culture, ethnology, etc.), without breaking through interdisciplinary cross-research; more scholars think independently, and the density of cooperation is not high. And the core group of authors is relatively discrete, which is an obstacle to the systematic formation, development, cohesion and precipitation of non-heritage research.

3.3 Distribution of Research Institutions

From the distribution of research institutions, it can be seen that the largest and brightest aperture in the following map is the Institute of Ethnology and Literature of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences (CASS), indicating the backbone of the research on ICH played by the Institute of Ethnology and Literature of the CASS. In addition, the Law School of Chongqing University, the Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, the School of Sociology of Peking University, and the School of Arts and Law of Shandong University of Science and Technology are all core institutions in ICH research. The Institute of Ethnology and Literature of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences has the broadest and deepest research content, mostly on the protection, development and transmission of ICH, from theory to practice. In addition, with the advantage that most of the researchers in the Institute are from ethnic minorities, the results are characterized by a focus on the ICH of ethnic minorities. Other institutions have their own characteristics and focus. The Law School of Chongqing University focuses its research on

ICH on the law of intellectual property protection, and consciously conducts comparative research on the protection law between China and Japan. The Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences (CASS) studies ICH in countries and nations mostly from an anthropological perspective. The Department of Sociology of Peking University starts from a humanistic and cultural perspective, exploring cultural self-consciousness and cultural values in ICH. The College of Arts and Law of Shandong University of Science and Technology focuses on the research of ICH, focusing on its industrialization and tourism, and realizing the benign interaction between intangible heritage protection and tourism development.

Further analyzing the obtained data, it can be obtained that there are 218 research institutes in 1000 pieces of literature, and among the many research institutes, the total number of research institutes with the number of articles greater than or equal to 2 is 115, of which the number of institutes with the number of articles greater than or equal to 3 is 8, and the geographic location of each issuing institute is relatively concentrated in Beijing. This shows that Beijing, as the political and cultural center of China, attaches great importance to the research of ICH and has a unique resource advantage. From the analysis of the relationship between the authors and several issuing institutions, the research on ICH takes the research institutes and the faculties of arts and humanities of each university as the main research institutions. It shows a centralized development pattern, which is also conducive to the sustainability of research.

3.4 Distribution of Major Publication Areas and Journals

Knowing the major publications in a certain research field will help to determine the specialization of the field and the degree of importance attached to the topic by each specialized field, and thus determine the major core publications in the field. Most of the related disciplines on ICH research are concentrated in the fields of culture, ethnology, art, and librarianship.

Regarding the research on ICH, this paper totals 1000 journal articles included in CSSCI source journals (including extended version) and magazines with the number of articles greater than or equal to 10 articles in the research field of ICH. We can find that the total number of magazines with more than 10 articles is 22, and the total number of joint articles is 496. From the perspective of the professional fields of the journal authors, according to the CSSCI discipline classification standard, the disciplines to which the journal articles belong are mainly in the fields of culture, ethnology, art, library and information science. It can be seen that the research on ICH has the following two characteristics: firstly, the research results related to ICH have their own independent journals, which shows the degree of importance attached to ICH by the state as well as by the current academic circles and the inheritance of the current research; secondly, the distribution of journals is more centralized, and the relevant research results mainly come from the fields of culture, ethnology, art and so on, and the journals issuing the articles are mostly in The relevant research results mainly come from the fields of culture, ethnology, art, etc., and most of the journals are published in the nationalities, and there are fewer relevant researches in developed regions and coastal regions.

3.5 Keyword Cluster Analysis

Keywords are both a high degree of condensation of the connotation of the article and can illustrate the main scientific research theme of the article to be expressed. Keyword clustering analysis is to cluster keywords with high degree of relevance and close connection into one class, and select the keywords with the greatest degree of relevance to be labeled, so as to judge and test the knowledge subgroups with directionality and representativeness in a certain research field. The frequency of keywords with the node size, the larger the number of nodes, the higher the frequency of keywords; the depth of interconnection between the keywords to the nodes between the line thickness, the thicker the line between the nodes, the stronger the link between the keywords; the affinity between the subject is reflected by the proximity of nodes between the distance between the nodes, the closer the nodes, the closer the relationship between the representative of the subject. Under normal circumstances, the higher the frequency of a keyword in a piece of literature, the more intimate the relationship between the two topics. A relatively clear mapping of the keyword clustering knowledge structure is obtained through the software program operation, which also presents a total of nine groups of knowledge subgroups clustered in the twenty-four festivals, conservation, ICH science, ICH conservation, ICH law,

productive conservation, non-heritage, community participation, and big data. The average model value of the cluster analysis method indicates that the cluster analysis method is well-structured and has convincing results.

Since this study centers on the theme of “ICH”, “ICH” appears most frequently and has the strongest centrality. By combing the relevant data of the mapping to derive, it is very obvious to find that the important nodes with strong central attributes in the research field of ICH are: “ICH protection”, “protection”, “inheritance”, “ethnic minorities”, of which the frequency of “ICH” is up to 734 times, with a keyword centrality of 1.46. “protection” 73 times, centrality 0.15, “ICH protection” 47 times, centrality 0.24, indicating that the current academic scholars in the field of ICH researchers are mainly focused on ICH from the inheritance and protection to Summarize and research. In this process, the attention to the intangible heritage of the non-hereditary bearers and ethnic minorities is getting stronger and stronger, and more and more experts and scholars are calling for the productive development of the ICH from the perspectives of cultural industry and tourism development, which greatly enhances the visibility of the industry at the same time. There are also scholars from the perspective of ICH law to explain, through the interpretation of policies, laws and regulations, can be more clear public responsibility and obligation, for the protection and inheritance of ICH plays an important role.

3.6 Citation Analysis

Researchers often cite previous research in their academic papers and will include it in the form of references in their studies. Literature citation analysis is a bibliometric way of expressing the degree of association among the literature by analyzing the frequency of citation by other literature to determine the literature that has had a significant impact in the field of study. It is also a bibliometric way to express the degree of association between documents, which is expressed by the frequency of citation by other documents. The higher the frequency of citation, the closer the association is, and the stronger the interoperability of academic backgrounds between the documents. From the principle of bibliometrics, research frontiers are composed of citation analysis, and the knowledge base is composed of cited papers. If the research frontier is considered as the future development of the research field, the knowledge base may be represented by literature co-citation clustering. From the perspective of new knowledge areas, if we want to study typical papers with key scientific innovation theories or produce important theoretical innovations, the important node paper is the most important research object, and at the same time, it has the potential to constitute the important papers that are the hotspots of the current scientific development frontiers.

The data imported into CiteSpace software were analyzed to obtain the ICH literature data and citation maps from 2011-2021. In CiteSpace, in order to keep the number of nodes and connections in the keyword co-occurrence map within a reasonable range, the top fifty keywords were extracted by controlling the size of the threshold value and slicing the year as a unit. The clustering yielded a total of 231 keyword nodes, 427 connections, and a journal citation knowledge map with a density of 0.0161.

The academic works that have had a key impact on the study of ICH in China during the period 2011-2021 can be summarized., *Theoretical Reflections on the Protection of ICH* (He, 2005), made a theoretical study on the blind, mechanized, one-sided and utilitarian protection of intangible historical and cultural heritage at that time. With the development and change of China's economy and society, the book continues to resonate with everyone. *On the Protection of China's ICH in the Context of Globalization* (Liu, 2007) explored the preservation of ICH from a new perspective, laying the foundation for the concrete implementation of the protection of China's ICH. *ICH as Public Culture* (Gao, 2008) combines the concept of public culture with ICH and proposes that ICH bearers carry a community-oriented public culture transformation mechanism, which has triggered heated discussions in the academic community. *ICH: From Concept to Practice* (Bamo, 2008) summarizes that in the past thirty years, the global community has made continuous efforts to discuss the definition of the concept of “ICH”, which has always been permeated by the conflict and quarrels to peaceful communication and then to introspection, compromise and tolerance. Throughout the process, there has been a dialogue from conflict to peaceful communication to introspection, compromise and tolerance, and the understanding, concern and consensus of human beings have been increasing with the further expansion of the scope of ICH. With the continuous development of science and technology, Wu used GIS spatial technology to analyze the spatial distribution of national ICH, which is of

great significance for China's regional cultural statistics, protection, development and integration. Scholars have enriched and improved the foundation of ICH doctrine from different perspectives. Whether in theory or practice, these studies are of guiding or creative significance for the future protection of ICH.

3.7 Journal Co-citation Analysis

Journal co-citation analysis method is mainly to consolidate the identification of highly co-cited journals and calculate the degree of academic linkages among journals using bibliometric methods. Through the method of journal co-citation analysis, we can learn the citation ecosystem of the specialized research field and the core journal papers that play a dominant role in the specialized field. The imported data were classified in CiteSpace software to visualize the journal co-citation map. After clustering, an individual network with 397 nodes and 1760 connections is obtained.

A circle node equals the same highly cited journal, the size of the circle where the journal is located represents its frequency of publication, and the connecting line between the nodes indicates the existence of a co-citation relationship between the journals. The thresholds on the panels were adjusted for clarity of the results. The connecting lines between the nodes represent the co-citation of related journals. In order to better grasp and analyze the high-frequency keywords co-cited by journals, this paper lists 19 keywords (in descending order of citation frequency).

From the data, there are 19 types of core journals in the research field of ICH in China that have been cited more than 30 times in the past ten years. Humanities and social sciences general journals are the types of high-frequency co-cited journals with the highest number of citations in the scientific research field of ICH research in China. Before the rise of ICH research, the topics of academic papers published by journals in previous years were mostly traditional folklore research such as culture, ethnology and folklore. After the emergence of ICH research, the content of ICH has gradually spread and penetrated into different fields such as tourism, archaeology, art, human geography, archives, museology, librarianship, jurisprudence, journalism and communication, kinesiology, theater, and computers, etc., which shows that the ICH is a cross-disciplinary field that can be flexibly dealt with and applied.

To sum up, firstly, from the perspective of research cooperation, the current number of research organizations in the field of scientific research on ICH is relatively large, and a series of organizations and research groups with the Institute of Ethnology and Literature of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences as the core have been formed. From the analysis of the relationship between the author of the article and the organization that issued the article, to the research of ICH to the major scientific research institutes as well as various colleges and universities across the country in the College of Letters, College of Humanities as the focus of the research institutions, showing a centralized development mode. However, the collaboration between scientific research organizations and researchers is mostly confined within the group, and cross-group collaborative research is also less, the phenomenon of lone struggle is common, and the research presents the characteristics of overall dispersion and local aggregation. This is also not conducive to the continuous expansion of research results.

Secondly, from the point of view of the main publishing fields and the distribution of journals, domestic scholars' researches on ICH mainly present the following two characteristics: firstly, the relevant researches on ICH have their own independent journals, which shows that the state and the current academic circles attach importance to intangible heritage and the inheritance of researches; secondly, the distribution of journals is more concentrated, and the relevant researches mainly come from the fields of culture, ethnology, art and so on. Secondly, the distribution of journals is more concentrated, and the relevant research results mainly come from the fields of culture, ethnology, art and so on.

Thirdly, from the perspective of research frontiers, through the analysis of keywords, we can conclude that the current research on intangible historical and cultural heritage by academic researchers mainly focuses on summarizing and studying the inheritance and preservation of intangible historical and cultural heritage. In this process, the attention to the intangible heritage of inheritors and ethnic minorities has become stronger and stronger, and more experts and scholars have proposed productive research on intangible cultural property from the perspectives of history and culture, tourism development, etc., which has greatly improved the recognition while industrialization. There are also scholars to explain from the perspective of ICH law, through the

interpretation of policy provisions, can be more clear public responsibilities and obligations, for the protection and inheritance of intangible heritage play an important role. Through the co-citation of literature to form the research frontiers of the discipline, the cited literature forms a new research unit, which represents the current research direction of the academia on the relevant topics. From the co-citation of journals in recent years, we can also get that the content of ICH is not only limited to its own field, but also extended to human geography, tourism, law, sports, librarianship and other specialized fields with a large span of knowledge, which also reflects that the study of ICH of mankind is a cross-cutting and multi-directional integration of the research scope.

4. Conclusion

The first prosperous period of China's intangible historical and cultural heritage has already passed, even though the number of concerned groups has increased and the research results have been gradually enriched, at present, the relevant research groups are mainly in the humanities and social sciences, and the space for interdisciplinary exchanges, cooperation, and development is still wide open. In the future, in addition to combining with digital technology, ICH can also be understood and analyzed from multiple levels and dimensions, such as biology, public relations, medicine, and economics.

In addition, how to combine ICH with national spirit and national identity is also an issue worth exploring. Although academic research in the field of ICH has been going on for more than 20 years, it still takes time for in-depth exploration of how to position intangible culture scientifically in a new era of preaching cultural confidence and cultural self-improvement. 2021 The Opinions on Further Strengthening the Safeguarding of ICH were issued by the General Office of the Central Committee of the Communist Party of China (CPC) and the General Office of the State Council. After in-depth study of the objectives, principles and practices of the Opinions regarding the soundness, protection and inheritance of ICH, how to put China's ICH and the results of previous research into effective service for its creative transformation and innovative development, and to show the charm of Chinese culture are also the main issues that need to be paid attention to and solved by today's research workers and ICH protectors and inheritors.

References

- Bamo, Q. (2008). Intangible cultural heritage: From concept to practice. *National Art*, (1), 6-17.
- Gao, B. (2008). Intangible cultural heritage as public culture. *Literary and Art Studies*, (2), 77-83.
- He, X. (2005). Theoretical reflections on the protection of intangible cultural heritage. *Jiangxi Social Sciences*, (2), 103-109.
- Hu, X. (2014). What new contributions can the convention for the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage bring to China: Also discussing the concept of regional holistic protection of intangible cultural heritage. *Cultural Heritage*, (1), 1-8.
- Jin, X., Chen, Y., & Zhong, Z. (2003). How libraries actively participate in the protection of intangible cultural heritage. *Library Journal*, (2), 55-56.
- Liu, K. (2007). On the protection of China's intangible cultural heritage in the context of globalization. *Henan Social Sciences*, (1), 25-34.
- Qiao, X. (2003). On agricultural cultural resources and intangible cultural heritage. *Journal of Yunnan Nationalities University (Philosophy and Social Sciences Edition)*, (4), 83-86.

Funding

This research was funded by one of the research outcomes of the 2024 Quality Engineering Project of Guangzhou Municipal Education Bureau: Exploratory Study on Teaching Reform of the Course *Audiovisual Language* Based on the OBE Concept (Project No.: 2024YBJG049), and Research on Countermeasures for Implementing Aesthetic Education in Higher Vocational Colleges (Project No.: 2022WTSCX225).

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgment

This paper is an output of the research outcomes of the 2024 Quality Engineering Project of Guangzhou Municipal Education Bureau: Exploratory Study on Teaching Reform of the Course Audiovisual Language Based on the OBE Concept (Project No.: 2024YBJG049), and Research on Countermeasures for Implementing Aesthetic Education in Higher Vocational Colleges (Project No.: 2022WTSCX225).

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).